

ATTENTION: PUBLIC SAFETY COMMITTEE MEMBERS WILL RECEIVE A UNIQUE PANELIST LINK BY EMAIL. PLEASE USE THIS LINK TO PARTICIPATE IN THIS MEETING.



PUBLIC SAFETY COMMITTEE MEETING AGENDA

MONDAY, SEPTEMBER 14, 2020
9:00 a.m.

Pursuant to Governor Newsom's Executive Order N-29-20 (March 18, 2020), the Public Safety Committee meeting will only be conducted via video/teleconferencing.

INSTRUCTIONS FOR PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

Members of the public may use the following link:

<https://us02web.zoom.us/j/81823346781?pwd=K1NrdXBnQzRSMkNxbVFBci95aDY2Zz09>

Password: 366703

One Tap Mobile: +16699009128,,81823346781#

Dial In: +1 669 900 9128

Webinar ID: 818 2334 6781

Password: 366703

*This will provide listening access and ability to address the
Public Safety Committee when called upon.*

IF YOU ARE UNABLE TO CONNECT VIA DIAL IN OPTION, PLEASE CALL 760-346-1127.

Public Comment is encouraged to be emailed to the Public Safety Committee meeting prior to the meeting at cvag@cvag.org by 5:00 p.m. on the day prior to the committee meeting. Comments intended to be read aloud should be no more than 300 characters.

**THIS MEETING IS HANDICAPPED ACCESSIBLE.
ACTION MAY RESULT ON ANY ITEMS ON THIS AGENDA.**

1. **CALL TO ORDER** – Chair John Peña, Mayor Pro Tem, City of La Quinta

2. **ROLL CALL**
 - A. **Member Roster** P4

3. **PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

4. **PUBLIC COMMENTS ON AGENDA ITEMS**

This is the time and place for members of the public to address the Public Safety Committee on agenda items. At the discretion of the Chair, comments may be taken at the time items are presented. Please limit comments to three (3) minutes.

5. **CHAIR / EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR ANNOUNCEMENTS**

6. **EX-OFFICIO UPDATES**

7. **CONSENT CALENDAR**
 - A. **Approve the June 8, 2020 Public Safety Committee Minutes** P5

8. **DISCUSSION / ACTION**
 - A. **Election of Public Safety Committee Officers – Tom Kirk** P9
Recommendation: Elect a Chair and Vice Chair for the Public Safety Committee for Fiscal Year 2020/2021

 - B. **Update on COVID-19 Public Health Crisis – Jeff Van Wagenen, Riverside County**
Recommendation: Information only

 - C. **Community Listening Sessions on Racism and Policing – Tom Cox** P11
Recommendation: Provide direction about organizing a valleywide conversation on racism and policing

9. **INFORMATION**
 - A. **Attendance Record** P13

10. **PUBLIC COMMENTS ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS**

This is the time and place for members of the public to address the Public Safety Committee on items of general interest within the purview of this committee. Please limit comments to two (2) minutes.

11. **ANNOUNCEMENTS**

Upcoming Zoom Meetings:

Executive Committee – Monday, September 21, 2020 at 4:30 p.m.

Public Safety Committee – Monday, November 9, 2020 at 9:00 a.m.

12. **ADJOURNMENT**

Item 2A

**Coachella Valley Association of Governments
Public Safety Committee
Member Roster
2020-2021**



Voting Members		
City of Blythe	Councilmember Johnny Rodriguez	
City of Cathedral City	Councilmember Mark Carnevale	
City of Coachella	Councilmember Megan Beaman-Jacinto	
City of Desert Hot Springs	Councilmember Russell Betts	
City of Indian Wells	Councilmember Ted Mertens	
City of Indio	Councilmember Waymond Fermon - VICE CHAIR	
City of La Quinta	Councilmember John Peña - CHAIR	
City of Palm Desert	Mayor Pro Tem Kathleen Kelly	
City of Palm Springs	Mayor Pro Tem Christy Holstege	
City of Rancho Mirage	Councilmember Iris Smotrich	
County of Riverside	Supervisor V. Manuel Perez	
Agua Caliente Band of Cahuilla Indians	Vacant	
Cabazon Band of Mission Indians	Vacant	
Ex-Officio Members		
Agua Caliente Band of Cahuilla Indians	Margaret Muhr, Emergency Services Manager	
Cathedral City Police	George Crum, Chief of Police	
Cathedral City Fire	Blake Goetz, Interim Fire Chief	
Desert Hot Springs Police	Jim Henson, Chief of Police	
Thermal Sheriff Station	Misty Reynolds, Captain	
Indio Police	Mike Washburn, Chief of Police	
Riverside County Sheriff's Department	Sheriff Chad Bianco	
Palm Desert Sheriff Station	Joseph Belli, Captain	
Palm Springs Police	Bryan Reyes, Chief of Police	
Palm Springs Fire	J. Kevin Nalder, Fire Chief	
Riverside County Fire Department	Eddy Moore, Division Chief	
California Highway Patrol	Dennis Woodbury, Commander	
U.S. Border Patrol	David Kim	
District Attorney's Office	Michael Hestrin, District Attorney	
Riverside County Probation Department	Ron Miller, Chief Probation Officer	
Staff		
Tom Kirk, Executive Director	Tom Cox, Management Analyst	Libby Carlson, Sr. Program Analyst

ITEM 7A

Public Safety Committee
Meeting Minutes
June 8, 2020



The audio file for this meeting can be found at: <http://www.cvag.org/audio.htm>

1. **CALL TO ORDER** - The meeting was called to order by Chair John Peña, City of La Quinta, at 9 a.m. via Zoom videoconference, pursuant to Gov. Newsom's executive order governing how public meetings are held during the COVID-19 pandemic.
2. **ROLL CALL** - Roll call taken and it was determined that a quorum was present.

Members Present

City of Cathedral City	Councilmember Mark Carnevale
City of Coachella	Councilmember Megan Beaman Jacinto
City of Desert Hot Springs	Councilmember Russell Betts
City of Indian Wells	Councilmember Ted Mertens
City of Indio	Councilmember Waymond Fermon, Vice Chair
City of La Quinta	Mayor Pro Tem John Peña, Chair
City of Palm Desert	Mayor Pro Tem Kathleen Kelly
City of Palm Springs	Mayor Pro Tem Christy Holstege
City of Rancho Mirage	Councilmember Iris Smotrich
Riverside County	Assistant CEO Jeff Van Wagenen

Ex-Officio Members Present

California Highway Patrol	Dennis Woodbury
City of Cathedral City Fire	Interim Chief Blake Goetz
City of Cathedral City	Chief George Crum
City of Desert Hot Springs Police	Chief Jim Henson
City of Indio Police	Chief Mike Washburn
City of Palm Springs Police	Chief Bryan Reyes
Riverside County District Attorney	Gerald Fineman
Riverside County Fire Department	Eddy Moore
Riverside County Probation	Cristine Castro
Riverside County Sheriff	Sheriff Chad Bianco

Members & Ex-Officios Not Present

Aqua Caliente	Margaret Muhr
Palm Desert Sheriff Station	Captain Joseph Belli
City of Palm Springs Fire	Chief J. Kevin Nalder
Thermal Sheriff Station	Captain Misty Reynolds
U.S. Customs and Border Patrol	David Kim, Assistant Chief Patrol Agent

Others Present

CVAG	Tom Kirk
------	----------

CVAG
CVAG
CVAG
CVAG
CVAG
CVAG/ Riverside County
CVUSD
City of La Quinta
Riverside County Emergency
Management Department
Additional participants

Tom Cox
Libby Carlson
Erica Felci
Joanna Stueckle
Oscar Vizcarra
Greg Rodriguez
Paula Marvin
Mayor Linda Evans
Director Bruce Barton

Two additional callers by phone

3. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS ON AGENDA ITEMS

Briana DeAztlan submitted written comments on the recent county-issued curfew.

Melina Duarte submitted written comments about the Riverside County Sheriff's Department adopting new policies and gave suggestions for the newly formed County Review Task Force.

Erin Teran made comments via phone about the curfew and its impact on the scheduled Black Lives Matter Vigil, which was planned for Miles Park in the City of Indio.

5. CHAIR / COMMITTEE MEMBER/CVAG STAFF COMMENTS

Councilmember Megan Beaman Jacinto encouraged everyone to mute their microphones so they do not interrupt public speakers. Councilmember Beaman Jacinto and Councilmember Waymond Fermon also spoke about the national dialogue that was occurring around race and law enforcement policies.

6. EX-OFFICIO COMMENTS

Interim Fire Chief Blake Goetz of Cathedral City stated he will serve four-five months as the City replaces retired Chief Wilson.

Chief Eddy Moore of Riverside County Fire Department pointed out that peak fire season was declared and all staffing for aircraft are ready for all summer fires. The County was also working with Supervisor V. Manuel Perez's Office and a task force to eliminate unwanted fires due to illegal dumping.

7. CONSENT CALENDAR

A. Approve the May 11, 2020 Public Safety Committee Meeting Minutes

**IT WAS MOVED BY COUNCILMEMBER FERMON AND SECONDED BY
COUNCILMEMBER MERTENS TO APPROVE THE CONSENT CALENDAR ITEM:**

THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Councilmember Mark Carnevale	AYE
Councilmember Megan Beaman Jacinto	AYE
Councilmember Russell Betts	AYE
Councilmember Ted Mertens	AYE
Councilmember Waymond Fermon	AYE
Mayor Pro Tem John Peña	AYE
Mayor Pro Tem Kathleen Kelly	AYE
Mayor Pro Tem Christy Holstege	AYE
Councilmember Iris Smotrich	AYE
Assistant CEO Jeff Van Wagenen	AYE

8. DISCUSSION / ACTION

A. COVID19 Update

Jeff Van Wagenen, Riverside County Assistant CEO, and Bruce Barton, Riverside County Emergency Management Department Director, provided an update on COVID-19. A member discussion ensued.

There was no action taken.

B. Public Safety Round Table Discussion

A roundtable discussion was held with Palm Springs Chief Bryan Reyes, Indio Police Chief Mike Washburn and Riverside County Sheriff Chad Bianco. Topics included a recap of recent events in the nation, protests in the Coachella Valley, as well as thoughts on systemic racism, use of excessive force, public right to protest, and potential rioting along with next steps and best practices. A lengthy discussion was held among the Committee members, including discussion of public protests and understanding policing policies across the valley.

There was a motion by Councilmember Fermon and seconded by Councilmember Carnevale to approve a draft resolution that had been prepared to recognize the Coachella Valley's public safety response to recent protests. Amid further discussion about the resolution and the timing of the Executive Committee's consideration of it, the motion was withdrawn.

Chair Pena recommended an ad hoc committee be formed to further discuss the resolution and the related issues of race and policing. The ad hoc would consist of Councilmember Fermon, Mayor Pro Tem Holstege and Councilmember Beaman Jacinto.

9. INFORMATION – The following items were provided for information only:

A. Attendance Record

B. Streamlined Per Diem Process for CVAG Committees

C. 2020 CVAG General Assembly Information

10. PUBLIC COMMENTS ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS

None.

11. ANNOUNCEMENTS –Upcoming Meetings via Zoom:

- Executive Committee – Monday, June 8, 2020 at 4:30 p.m.
- General Assembly – Monday, June 29, 2020

12. ADJOURN - The meeting was adjourned at 11:05 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Tom Cox
Management Analyst

ITEM 8A

Coachella Valley Association of Governments
Public Safety Committee
September 14, 2020



Staff Report

Subject: Election of Public Safety Committee Officers

Contact: Tom Kirk, Executive Director (tkirk@cvag.org)

Recommendation: Elect a Chair and Vice Chair for the Public Safety Committee for Fiscal Year 2020/2021

Background: Each fiscal year, the Public Safety Committee considers the election of a Chair and Vice Chair. The Committee does not have a formal officer rotation, or a set policy for how to select the Chair and Vice Chair.

A list of the officers for this Committee, dating back to 2010, is attached for member information.

Staff recommends that the Public Safety Committee provide nominations and elect its officers for this fiscal year.

Attachment: History of Chair and Vice Chair

**PUBLIC SAFETY COMMITTEE
CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR HISTORY**



	<u>Chair</u>	<u>Vice Chair</u>
2019/2020	John Peña	Waymond Fermon
2018/2019	Russell Betts	John Peña
2017/2018	Betty Sanchez	Russell Betts
2016/2017	Betty Sanchez	Russell Betts
2015/2016	Iris Smotrich	Betty Sanchez
2014/2015	Paul Lewin	Iris Smotrich
2013/2014	Paul Lewin	Iris Smotrich
2012/2013	Terry Henderson	Paul Lewin
2011/2012	Mary T. Roche	Terry Henderson
2010/2011	Lee Weigel	Mary T. Roche
2009/2010	Gene Gilbert	Lee Weigel

ITEM 8C

Coachella Valley Association of Governments
Public Safety Committee
September 14, 2020



Staff Report

Subject: Community listening sessions on racism and policing

Contact: Tom Cox, Management Analyst (tcox@cvag.org)

Recommendation: Provide direction about organizing a valleywide conversation on racism and policing

Background: At the June 8, 2020 meeting, a public safety roundtable discussion was held with Palm Springs Chief Bryan Reyes, Indio Police Chief Mike Washburn and Riverside County Sheriff Chad Bianco. Topics included a recap of the nationwide unrest that was sparked by the loss of George Floyd's life. The committee held a lengthy conversation about the protests that were occurring in the Coachella Valley, as well as thoughts on systemic racism, use of excessive force, public right to protest, and potential rioting along with next steps and best practices.

The Public Safety Committee considered a draft resolution that had been prepared to recognize the Coachella Valley's public safety response to recent protests. Amid further discussion, the Committee instead formed an ad hoc committee comprised of Committee Chair John Peña, Coachella Councilmember Megan Beaman Jacinto, Indio Councilmember Waymond Fermon and Palm Springs Mayor Pro Tem Christy Holstege.

The ad hoc committee met twice over the summer months. While the initial focus was to review and possibly refocus the resolution that had been presented at the June 8 meeting, the ad hoc committee members spent the time considering the CVAG Public Safety Committee's role in the valleywide conversations that are occurring on racism and policing. The consensus from the ad hoc was that continued community engagement is necessary, but that it should add to – not repeat – the actions that are being taken by Riverside County and local cities to host town halls and listening sessions.

There have been a number of local and County actions taken in recent months, which include the following:

- On August 4, 2020 the Riverside County Board of Supervisors voted 5-0 to officially declare racism a public health crisis. Supervisors V. Manuel Perez and Kevin Jeffries are working with the Executive Office to establish a series of community and department listening forums over the next couple of months. Following listening forums, the Board of Supervisors is expected to hold a workshop to determine next steps which will most likely be the establishment of some sort of task force.
- A Zoom listening session was held by the City of Palm Springs on July 18, 2020, that focused on policing, racism, discrimination and other related issues.
- The Coachella City Council on July 22, 2020 passed a resolution stating that "Systemic Racism is a Human Rights and Public Health Crisis Which Results in Disparities in Family Stability, Health and Mental Wellness, Education, Employment, Environmental Justice, Economic

Development, Transportation, Public Safety, Incarceration and Housing” and re-affirmed the City’s “Commitment to Advancing Justice, Equity, Diversity, and Inclusion in the City.”

- The City of Indio Council on September 1, 2020 passed a resolution declaring racism and inequity a Public Health Crisis.
- The City of Cathedral City had scheduled a special study session on September 9, 2020 to hold a community discussion on “race, policing and economic opportunity.”

The ad hoc committee has not made a specific recommendation on what role CVAG and the Public Safety Committee might take in the coming months, but did discuss several ideas as it pertained to regional listening sessions that foster a conversation in the Coachella Valley that builds on other ongoing efforts. The committee spent time discussing how best to engage the community amid the COVID-19 pandemic and social distancing restrictions. Among the ideas that were discussed was hiring a consultant to lead a regional survey and generate a data-driven report that summarizes the feedback from the community. Another idea was to host a tele-town hall, where participants are randomly called and encouraged to stay on the line with a moderator. The format, which has been used in the valley by Riverside County Transportation Commission, is usually done in the evenings and it is designed to reach people who may not otherwise attend a community event.

Staff is recommending the Public Safety Committee provide feedback and direction on potential next steps, which could then be taken to the Executive Committee for approval.

Fiscal Impact: CVAG’s Fiscal Year 2020/2021 Budget did not include funding for a valleywide listening session, so any costs would be funded from the general fund.

The costs of community engagement would depend on the level and format. CVAG received preliminary estimates on a valleywide survey and data report range that ranged from \$11,200 to \$31,500, depending on the extensiveness of the data report. The work would include survey development, online and offline data collection, and data analysis and reporting.


CVAG also solicited an initial estimate on the tele-townhall format, which costs about \$4,025 to reach about 40,000-47,000 phone numbers. Based on the size of the Coachella Valley, CVAG could need more than one of these to reach residents across all cities.

Item 9A

**COACHELLA VALLEY ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS
PUBLIC SAFETY COMMITTEE
ATTENDANCE RECORD
FY2019-2020**

Voting Members	JUL	AUG	SEP	OCT	NOV	DEC	JAN	FEB	MAR	APR	MAY	JUN	ATTENDED
City of Blythe			*		●		*	○	○		○	○	1 out of 5
City of Cathedral City			*		●		*	●	○		●	●	3 out of 5
City of Coachella			*		●		*	●	●		●	●	5 out of 5
City of Desert Hot Springs			*		●		*	●	●		●	●	5 out of 5
City of Indian Wells			*		●		*	●	○		●	●	4 out of 5
City of Indio			*		●		*	●	●		○	●	4 out of 5
City of La Quinta			*		●		*	●	●		●	●	5 out of 5
City of Palm Desert			*		●		*	●	●		●	●	5 out of 5
City of Palm Springs			*		○		*	●	●		●	●	4 out of 5
City of Rancho Mirage			*		●		*	●	●		●	●	5 out of 5
Riverside County			*		●		*	●	●		●	●	5 out of 5
Aqua Caliente - Vacant													
Cabazon Band - Vacant													
Total Attendance Per Meeting					10			10	8		9	10	

Ex Officio / Non-Voting Members	JUL	AUG	SEP	OCT	NOV	DEC	JAN	FEB	MAR	APR	MAY	JUN	ATTENDED
Agua Caliente			*		○		*	○	○		○	○	0 out of 5
Cathedral City Police			*		○		*	●	○		○	●	2 out of 5
Cathedral City Fire			*		●		*	●	●		○	●	4 out of 5
Desert Hot Springs Police			*		○		*	●	●		●	●	4 out of 5
Indio Police			*		●		*	●	○		●	●	4 out of 5
Thermal Sheriff Station			*		●		*	●	●		●	○	4 out of 5
Palm Desert Sheriff Station			*		●		*	●	●		●	○	4 out of 5
Palm Springs Police			*		●		*	●	●		●	●	5 out of 5
Palm Springs Fire			*		○		*	○	●		●	○	4 out of 5
Riverside County Fire			*		●		*	●	○		●	●	4 out of 5
Riverside County Sheriff			*		○		*	○	●		○	●	2 out of 5
California Highway Patrol			*		●		*	●	●		●	●	5 out of 5
U.S. Border Patrol			*		●		*	●	●		●	○	4 out of 5
District Attorney's Office			*		○		*	●	●		●	●	4 out of 5
County Probation Department			*		●		*	●	●		●	●	5 out of 5
Total Attendance Per Meeting					9			12	11		11	10	

Scheduled Dark Month 
 No Meeting *
 Present ●
 Absent ○